EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING IN BUSINESS SCHOOLS IN KARACHI

Samra Javed1 & Nadia Ayub2

Abstract

The purpose of the research is to explore the use of experiential learning in Marketing, Human Resources Management and Finance courses of five leading business schools in Karachi. A quantitative survey research design was employed to answer the research questions of the study employing an Indigenous Use of Experiential Learning Scale (UELS) developed in compliance with the Guidelines of International Testing Commission 2013. According to the results the use of experiential learning differed (df (4,82) =15.565, p < .01) among business schools. From the research that has been undertaken, it is possible to conclude that experiential learning is used in all five business schools that were part of the study. The findings indicate that experiential learning, though comparatively a new concept in business education in Pakistan has found its way into business education.

Keywords: Experiential learning, human resource management, marketing, finance

JEL Classification: Z.000
Experiential Learning in Business Schools in Karachi

Business education in Pakistan is comparatively a new field and has only been formalized almost a decade back with the reconstitution of the former University Grant Commission as Higher Education Commission of Pakistan in 2002, allocation of sufficient funds to the education sector of country (Kolachi & Wajidi, 2008; Universities Building Pakistan, 2011 cited in Khan, Shah, & Azam, 2011) and the Higher Education Commission’s formalization of the list of business schools in Pakistan, development of course as well as selection criterion of faculty (Higher Education Commission, 2012). Although business education has now become a formalized sector of education in Pakistan, the issues and challenges faced by this sector are manifold including a lack of relevant research and significant industry background of faculty, ineffective methods of teaching, absence of local cases as well as linkages between academia and industry and most of all a discrepancy between Cumulative Grades Point Averages (CGPAs) and employability skills (Syed, Abiodullah, & Yousaf, 2014).

Factors such as these thwart the practical exposures to the skills required by business students. The traditional methods of teaching also known as Teacher Centered Approach to teaching rely heavily on transmission of information to pupils and acquisition of theoretical concept without focusing on the application of that knowledge and information (Khan, 2005) Hence, the system of imparting business education does not meet the expectations of the competitive business scenario of the country (Kolachi & Wajidi, 2008).

In business education across the globe, recently, there has been a gradual shift from teacher-centered approach towards experiential learning. Simply put, experiential learning is defined as learning by doing and making meaning from direct experiences. Learning from experience by yourself might be called “nature’s way of learning” and “education that occurs as a direct participation in the events of life” (Houle, 1980 cited in Smith, 2001, p. 221).

Over the last many years, the concept of experiential learning has gained strength in the area of teaching and learning as educators
have observed that experiential methods in teaching are more effective than other conventional methods in terms of students’ deeper levels of understanding of the concepts, their active involvement in classes, and improvement in their skills. Experiential learning is a great way for learning opportunities to take place that goes beyond the traditional lectures and reading and writing assignments (Shapiro, Nancy & Levine, 1999). Teaching in business administration is no exception to the above-mentioned fact as focus on experiential learning is now considered an important teaching method in the discipline. The teaching of business administration in Pakistan is also undergoing a change in methodology and many business schools are constantly striving towards the case method following Harvard Business School.

Hence, the purpose of the research was to find out the said change in methodology and the use of experiential learning in Marketing, Human Resources Management and Finance courses of five leading business schools in Karachi. A hypothesis, i.e., There would be difference in use of experiential learning between universities, was formulated to address the research question.

**Experiential Learning Theory (ELT)**

Experiential learning can be defined as a process a learner undergoes to create meaning from actual experience (Dewey, 1933) and “… a sequence of events with more or one identified learning objectives, requiring active involvement by participants at one or more points in the sequence” (Waltes & Marks, 1981, p.1 cited in Graf & Kellogg, 1998). Smith (2001) defined experiential learning as the type of learning acquired by learners who get to apply knowledge and skills in a direct and appropriate situation (Smith, 2001 p. 1 cited in Clark, Threeton, & Ewing, 2010). It is important to note that it entails a direct experiential engagement with the learning experience instead of a thought process connected with the learning (Borzak, 1981).

Kolb (1984) is considered the pioneer of the theory of experiential learning which he initiated around 20 years ago. His theory has now been recognized as a well-organized model of learning grounded in the theoretical framework of personal experience (Ausburn & Brown, 2007). It proposes a constructivist theory of learning and defines
learning as “the process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience. There has been an extensive research on his theory with around 1,000 articles written on that since its inception (D. A. Kolb, Boyatzis, & Mainemelis, 2000).

Model of Experiential Learning

Kolb’s model called ‘experiential learning cycle’ as shown in the figure 1 below consists of four elements namely, concrete experience, observation and reflection, the formation of abstract concepts and testing in new situations.

![Kolb's Model (1994)](image)

*Figure 1. Kolb’s Model (1994)*

For Kolb (1984) experiential learning is an activity that takes place when, a) a person is involved in a task, b) he looks back and evaluates it, c) determines what was useful or important to remember and d) uses this information to perform another activity or task. There are three stages of the ELT Model (Kolb, 1984). The model of experiential learning presents two approaches each of grasping (Concrete Experience (CE) and Abstract Conceptualization (AC) and transforming experience Reflective Observation (RO) and Active Experimentation (AE). The learner “touches all the bases” – he/she experiences, reflects, thinks, and acts - in a repeated process in response to the learning situation. James Zull (2002), a biologist, suggests a connection between experiential learning and brain functioning. Therefore, the structure of the brain creates the entire learning cycle (Zull, 2004).
There are variations in students’ learning styles and they choose careers that match their learning styles (Kolb, 1981). ELT is an all-inclusive framework that familiarizes the diverse ways of learning with one another. ELT posits that in order to meet the demands of careers, the experiential educators need to develop and integrate all phases of learning and acquisition of skills related to all four phase of the learning cycle (Kolb, 1984). The design of experiential learning offers a diverse range of teaching methodologies that help learners experience all phases of the learning cycle.

**Experiential Learning in Higher Education**

The theory furnishes an explanation for a variety of learning methods, including independent learning, learning by doing, work-based learning, and problem-based learning (Gibbs & Jenkins, 1992; Henry, 1989 in Healey & Jenkins, 2000). Educators, managers and instructors today realize the value of ELT and Kolb’s learning styles model in understanding and explaining human learning behavior and therefore, suggest how to teach better (Cowan, 1998, in Healey & Jenkins, 2000). There has been a substantial evidence by researchers (Mok, 1999); (Paul & Mukhopadhyay, 2005; Koehler, Lawroski and Bischoff, 1995; P. R. McCarthy & McCarthy, 2006) that experiential learning turns classroom learning into a meaningful and focused activity that helps learners develop skills that are required by the hiring market.

To prepare the higher education graduates ready for practical work, the application of experiential leaning theory has become an economic necessity. In addition, the ever increasing demands on the higher education push us to know more about the different learning styles of learners (Healey & Jenkins, 2000).

Application of this theory is seen in diverse fields such as education (Cassidy, 2004; Jones, Reichard, & Mokhtari, 2003; Loo, 2004; Pedrosa de Jesus, Almeida, & Watts, 2004), business (Paul & Mukhopadhyay, 2004 cited in Azerdo, 2010), psychology (Desmedt & Valcke, 2004 cited in Azerdo, 2010), business (Sims, 1983; Swailes & Senior, 2001 cited in Azerdo, 2010), and medicine (Grace, 2001; Reese, 1998, cited in Azerdo, 2010). Students have been helped in their self-awareness (Bradbeer, 1999 cited in Healey & Jenkins, 2000), teachers in their reflective practices (Burkill et
Experiential Learning in Business Schools in Karachi

Research

al., 2000 cited in Healey & Jenkins, 2000) and students in reflective learning (Birnie & Mason O’Connor, 1998 cited in (Healey & Jenkins, 2000). When learners apply the theory to real life situations, they improve on their problem solving skills (Henshaw and Jackson, 1984).

There has been a substantial evidence by researchers (Mok, 1999); (Paul & Mukhopadhyay, 2005; Koehler, Lawroski and Bischoff, 1995; P. R. McCarthy & McCarthy, 2006) that experiential learning turns classroom learning into a meaningful and focused activity that helps learners develop skills that are required by the hiring market. Mok (1999) proposed 10 functional attributes that could frame a model of experiential learning. The study tested the appropriateness of these attributes with education students by placing the attributes against key indicators and the respondents’ perceptions regarding the effectiveness of experiential activities by comparing their effect with that of study journal learning (maintaining a record of learning). The respondents gave a high rating to the former activity in experiential attributes as compared to the latter.

Seibert, Hart and Sypher (1989) and Baker (1991) cited in Cantor (1995) have maintained the above mentioned application of Experiential Learning. In addition, they recognized the advantages of experiential learning in career decision making. Experiential learning activities also comprise cooperative education placements, practicum experiences, and classroom-based hands-on laboratory activities which are suitable for providing hands on experience that prepares them for real time work environment (Cantor, 1995; Nguyen & Trimarchi, 2010).

Integration of experiential learning activities has been reported to have improved students’ academic performance in the higher education (Reitmeier, 2000 cited in Chavan, 2011), attitudes towards challenging material (Pugsley & Clayton, 2003 cited in Chavan, 2011) and has increased their level of motivation (Briers, 2005 cited in Chavan, 2011).

There is a gap seen in the learning that takes place at the academic level and its application in the real world. (Turnbull &
Madsen, 2006) describe the gap between academic learning and real world application by a beautiful example of a gymnast who cannot learn to perform gymnastics through lectures, reading assignments and written tests. The higher education is struggling to cope up with the challenging needs of technological and economic issues. Needless to say, a gap such as this can only be filled by incorporating experiential activities where students can apply the concepts they have acquired to deal with real business world issues (Turnbull & Madsen, 2006).

**Experiential Learning in Business Education across the Globe**

Use of experiential learning has been reported to be effective in various disciplines of business education as reflected in the review of literature that discusses subject wise initiatives in this respect. The use of the instructional models of experiential learning in business education has gained currency replacing case method which has been the focus of instructors and educators in the teaching of business administration (P. R. McCarthy & McCarthy, 2006). Experiential learning in business management has become the focus of educators in the United States because educators had observed declining trends in

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Academic Service Learning projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>• Redesigning of billing procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tutoring accounts to junior level students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provision of accounting services to the low strata community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>• Conduct of training programs in finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provision of training and material in budget planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Tutoring personal finance to junior level students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>• Promotion of events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Research on marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Development of a marketing plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>• Revision of and suggestion on performance appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Development of communication plans within a firm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Creation of job review videos to job candidates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Development of training programs for newly inducted employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Creation of job descriptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Provision of suggestions on interview procedure of a company</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
enrollments in full time MBA program over the last few years across the globe. This research identified the need of bridging the gap between the academic research carried out by business schools and competencies and skills needed by the practicing managers and that too little emphasis is laid on a change in the curriculum- a shift to real world management issues (Datar, Garvin & Cullen, 2010).

Experiential Learning in Marketing

Effectiveness of experiential learning has also been discussed in teaching marketing. (Vaccaro, 2008). The most relevant examples of the use of EL is Information technology integrated into marketing contributing to active students learning. (Peltier, Drago, & Schibrowsky, 2003; Peterson, Balasubramanian, & Bronnenberg, 1997; Benbunan-Fich, Lozada, Pirog, Priluck, &Wiseblit, 2001; McCorkle, Alexander, & Reardon, 2001 cited in Kaplan, Piskin, & Bol, 2010; Kaynama &Keesling, 2000; a project aimed at integrating the knowledge acquired in three different marketing courses and applying it to an experiential project (Barber et al., 2001; Bobbit et al., 2000; Bacon & Stewart, 2006 cited in Craciu, 2010).


Experiential Learning in Finance

There have been examples of the use of experiential exercises in the teaching of finance courses. Hays &DeLurgio (2010) contend that the financial crunch that has hit the world presents a challenging scenario to the finance students. The authors presented financial autopsies as an experiential activity that utilized data of banks that failed. The learning outcomes expected out of this exercise were exploration of banks as complex operational systems prone to financial
shocks, investigation of the relationship between management actions and financial consequences, development of student’s problem solving and analytical skills using data that was publically available. Other examples of the use of EL in accounting and finance include, a study reporting students using experiential learning performing significantly better as compared to the controlled group (Siegel, Omer, & Agrawal, 1997), and the use of games and reading interest rates from newspapers advertisements in financial management in order to make learning more meaningful (Koehler, Lawroski & Bischoff, 1965).

Peters (1997) asserts that students doing courses on Public Budgeting and Finance faced a fear of budget theory and that experiential learning can help students deal with these phobias by creating a link between information they already have and the new concepts in budgeting.

Experiential Learning in Human Resources

The teaching of Human Resources also implements experiential learning, as shown in the examples given below: Groenewald, Bushney, Odendaal, and Pieters (2004) present a case study on the use of experiential learning portfolio in National Diploma in Human Resources Management. The portfolio required students to develop a personal development program (PDP) (Groenewald, Bushney, Odendaal, & Pieters, 2004). Other examples are a course project in a training and development course by Burke (n.d.), provision of students’ services to a state government agency on the revision of employee manual. (Turnbull & Madsen, 2006), development of a system of performance appraisal that worked better than abrupt application of text books concepts (Pysarchik & Huddleston, 1994) and use of a simulation titled Petra Simulation Project (PSP) which proved to be really effective in students leadership, decision making skill and time management skills (Yaghi, 2008).

There is a lack of experiential learning material available for human resource management as compared to other areas of business management. According to Kuzmits (1986) cited in Pysarchik & Huddleston, 1994) very few texts are available for the same as compared to more than 30 texts that focus on theory of personnel/ human resources.
Business Education in Pakistan

Years of educational reforms and efforts after the partition have also not succeeded in making a difference in terms of the reputation and quality of the seats of higher education in Pakistan which are still not considered up to the mark (Mehmood & Rehman, 2011). None of Pakistan’s higher education universities is ranked in the first 500 universities in the world except for one in a certain discipline and the current scenario calls for a reformation in the educational system of Pakistan (Karim, 2007; QS World University Rankings, 2015). The traditional pedagogy has made the Higher Education in Pakistan perceived as unsuccessful in enhancing creative and critical thinking in students (Syed, Abiodullah, & Yousaf, 2014). Furthermore, owing to the teacher centered approach, the higher education institutions fail to equip students to handle the future issues of the society and expand on their knowledge (Khan, 2005). To be able to train business students to think critically and independently, we need faculty who are trained themselves along those lines and have the exposure of modern learner centered methods of teaching. Teachers following a traditional teaching approach limit their teaching to books only. There is a dire need to take initiatives at a level larger than the existing one to follow the learner centered approach in teaching business students (Kolachi & Wajidi, 2008). The latest version of business education curriculum places a huge value on training students to think critically, communicate effectively, analyze and synthesize information, reflect effective decision making and weigh different options to problem solving (National Business Education Accreditation Council, 2013).

A study was conducted in a business school in Karachi, Pakistan, to identify the experiential component in the core business administration courses of MBA program, using multi-mode qualitative research design employing documentary analysis and individual interviews and concluded that only a minor part (12%) of teaching methodology employed in MBA courses was experiential (Javed, Hussain & Karim, 2014). Synonymous with the business schools in the developed countries, accreditation from the Association of Advance Collegiate of Schools of Business (AACSB) is something the top-rated business schools of Pakistan are aiming for in near future. The accreditation requires the business schools to focus
primarily on leadership and management skills (Furutan, 2014; Payne & Tanner, 2011; Association to Advance Collegiate Schools of Business, 2015) and is one of the reasons for the schools to give a serious consideration to revisit their curriculum. In this respect, it is important to measure the extent to which Pakistani business graduates are developing the required skills as a result of experiential learning.

Although business education in Pakistan shows the shift towards the learner entered and experiential approach in its use of projects, activity based sessions and case studies, the impact of the use of experiential approach on those who are taught using such approach is yet an area to be explored. As per the entries in (1999) bibliography, research on experiential learning has been conducted from different parts of the (A. Y. Kolb & Kolb, 2008). However, no research from Pakistan has been entered in the same.

The research in the past indicates the effectiveness of experiential learning in different areas of business education. In addition, the concept of experiential learning, though not new for educators in many parts of the world, is still not being implemented in its basic principles and practices in business programs in Pakistan. Furthermore, no research has so far been conducted in the country to measure the impact of experiential learning in terms of skill development of students. Therefore, the purpose was to find out the use of experiential learning in Marketing, Human Resources Management and Finance courses of five leading business schools in Karachi. The research question of the study is as follows: 1. what is the use of experiential learning in Marketing, Human Resources Management and Finance courses of five leading business schools in Karachi.

Method

Participants

Convenience sampling was used as the sampling method for UELS of the research owing to the researcher’s ease and convenient accessibility of participants (Ross, 2005). The target population comprised faculty members teaching Marketing, Human Resources Management and Finance courses at undergraduate and graduate level of business schools in Karachi. (N=87) faculty members teaching
the same courses of business schools in Karachi were taken as a sample making up to ten percent of the population. The questionnaire was piloted on the sample, i.e., ten faculty members and descriptive statistics (including mean and standard deviation), and item total correlations was calculated.

Table 2

Frequency Table for Teachers’ Demographic Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic Variables</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>70.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 to 30 years</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>54.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 to 35 years</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 to 40 years</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 years and above</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>19.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPhil/MS</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>46.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRM</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length of Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-5 yrs</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>57.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-10 yrs</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-15 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-above</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 indicates demographic information of teachers which includes gender, age, qualification, specialization, and the length of service.

Design

The study was empirical in nature making use of primary data entailing a quantitative survey research design to enable the researcher to generalize the findings to a larger situation making use of a larger sample size as compared to the smaller sample used in a qualitative approach (Fielding & Pillinger, 2008). Since the research was aimed at finding answers to specific research questions a hypothesis was used to narrow down the research problem and focus on the desired outcomes of the study (Joyner, Rouse & Glatthorn, 2013).
Measure and Procedure

An Indigenous Use of Experiential Learning Scale (UELS) was developed in compliance with the Guidelines of International Testing Commission (International Testing Commission, 2013) as well as Hinkin’s model of scale development (Hinkin, 1998).

The researcher followed a deductive approach to generate the items of the scale. To ensure content adequacy, the theoretical foundations of the constructs served as the basis of the items generation. Originally nine questions were generated for the administration of the pilot study and out of which seven questions were retained in the final scale. To ensure “sufficient variance among respondents for subsequent data analysis” (Stone, 1978 cited in Hinkin 1998 p 110) likert scale was used in the questionnaire. The items were reviewed by language experts, faculty members and other senior researchers for content adequacy and conceptually inconsistent items were deleted after the review (International Testing Commission, 2001). To refine the scale and reduce the set of variables, descriptive statistics (including mean and standard deviation), and item total correlations was calculated. The reliability of the scale was estimated using Cronbach’s alpha after it had been administered to the sample.

To administer UELS, the researcher made a list of business schools in Karachi that are rated among the first five in terms of the year 2013 ranking of the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan, which is an independent, autonomous, and constitutionally established institution formulated to facilitate institutions of higher learning to serve as an engine of socio-economic development of Pakistan. UELS was administered to a sample to 87 teachers from five leading business schools in Karachi assuming that since experiential teaching method is a modern and comparatively new approach, it was more likely to find the use of experiential learning in the schools that are considered as top schools as per the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan.

Statistical Analysis

Statistical Packaging for Social Sciences (SPSS) Version17 was used to record, calculate and analyze the data of the research.
Responses to the questions were assigned codes for the purpose of recording. The demographic variables of the participants were analyzed using descriptive statistics. Analysis of Variance, one way (ANOVA) was administered to verify the hypotheses.

**Results**

An Indigenous Experiential Learning Scale (UELS) was developed in this study. The item total correlation of UELS was calculated. Each item of the scale are followed by five-point rating scale. Correlation range of item total was from .581 to .794 which reveals high correlation (See Table 3). To measure internal consistency of the Experiential Learning Scale (ELS), Cronbach alpha was calculated for each factor. An internal consistency of Experiential Learning Scale was 0.768(p< .001; n = 87), which reveals a highly significant score (Table 4).

**Table 3**

Mean, Standard Deviation, Item Total Correlations of Seven Items Use of Experiential Learning Scale (UELS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITEM NO.</th>
<th>MEAN</th>
<th>ST.D</th>
<th>ITEM-TOTAL PEARSON r</th>
<th>SIG</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.28</td>
<td>1.117</td>
<td>.642**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>.623**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>1.163</td>
<td>.764**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>1.166</td>
<td>.794**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>1.129</td>
<td>.581**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>1.305</td>
<td>.729**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>1.247</td>
<td>.728**</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

Table 3 presents descriptive statistics and item total correlation for the 87 participants. Each item of the scale are followed by five-point rating scale. Item 4 (r=.794; p< .01, n=87) reveals high correlation.
Table 4

Reliability Analysis (Alpha) for Use of Experiential Learning Scale (UELS)

Reliability Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No of Cases</th>
<th>No of Items</th>
<th>Cronbach alpha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>.768</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 presents internal consistency of Use of Experiential Learning Scale (UELS). To measure internal consistency of the Use of Experiential Learning Scale Cronbach’s alpha was calculated for each factor. An internal consistency of Use of Experiential Learning Scale was 0.768 (p < .001; n = 87), which reveals a highly significant correlation.

The findings of Analysis of Variance (ANOVA, One Way) for the hypothesis suggest that the use of experiential learning differed [df (4,82) = 15.565, p < .01] in the same. Use of Experiential learning was the highest in Business School 1 (M = 10.33), then in Business School 2 (M = 8.50), Business School 3 (M = 5.73), Business School 4 (M = 4.31), and Business School 5 (M = 3.83), respectively. The Tukey post hoc tests indicated that the use of experiential learning differed significantly among the business schools included in the study (p < .05) (Table 5 & 6).

Table 5

Summary of Analysis of Variance for the Variables between Business Schools and Use Experiential Teaching Method (N = 87)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business Schools</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business School 1</td>
<td>10.33</td>
<td>1.589</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>15.565</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business School 2</td>
<td>8.50</td>
<td>2.608</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business School 3</td>
<td>5.73</td>
<td>3.135</td>
<td>82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business School 4</td>
<td>4.31</td>
<td>2.330</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 use of experiential learning differed among business schools, df (4,82) = 15.565, p < .01. Use Experiential learning was higher in BS 1 (M = 10.33), then BS 2 (M = 8.50), BS 3 (M = 5.73), BS 4 (M = 4.31), and BS 5 (M = 3.83).
Discussion

The findings indicate that experiential learning, though comparatively a new concept in business education as compared to Medicine, Engineering and Science in Pakistan, has recently found its way to the discipline (Ranganath, 2012). However, the extent to which it is implemented as compared to the traditional teacher centered approach is yet to be ascertained.

The five universities in the research are rated as top five business schools in Karachi by the Higher Education Commission (HEC). HEC’s evaluation criteria include research, professional development programs, resources, qualification and accomplishments of teachers, and certain other factors (Higher Education Commission, 2014). It is important to note that HEC does not include the teaching methodology as a factor in the evaluation criteria of universities. Therefore, the findings might be attributed to the fact that the said factors perhaps have a relationship on the teaching methodology of a business school.
An important implication of the findings is that there are attempts by the teachers to cater to the growing needs of the employers and experiential learning is being implemented in all five universities of Karachi included in the study. However, as the findings indicate, some of the universities are using it more than the others but the factors supporting the said implementation need to be ascertained.

The findings further indicate that the teachers have the required resources to implement experiential learning similar to the findings of a recent research conducted in Pakistan which demonstrates that not only the college teachers are motivated to improve the existing practices of teaching, but the required resources for such change are available within the academic set up (Sultana & Zaki, 2015).

As discussed, experiential learning is commonly used in the top-notch business schools in the developed countries of the world. Since the local context of teaching in Pakistan is teacher centered and the students are also attuned to the traditional approach of teaching since their early years of education, the study has contextualized the value of experiential learning and has asserted that it is as valuable as in any developed part of the world since Pakistani students are as responsive to an experiential intervention in business education as a student of any other developed part of the world could be.

The main limitation of the study is that due to the small sample of respondents of the study, the extent to which this study could reach any generalization may be questioned. The focused questionnaires were also not adequate to give room to other issues such as perceptions and challenges of experiential learning. The study was only focused on the use of experiential learning in Marketing, Human Resources Management and Finance courses of BBA and MBA in five leading business schools in Karachi. Thus, the study limits its investigation to the disciplines of Human Resources, Finance and Marketing and does not include other courses in business administration such as Management, Communication skills and Accounting. The major challenges faced by the researcher that hindered taking a larger sample size during the study were delays in
permission by the faculty and management of business schools to collect data. Majority of the faculty were approached through personal contacts. Moreover, the busy schedule of faculty and the business schools did not allow the researcher to collect data as per expectations. Since the concept of experiential learning is still in its infancy in Pakistan, absence of local research studies left very little room for the researcher to contextualize the study and provide opportunities to compare and contrast the findings with relevant examples. Last but not the least, the response bias of participants could be one of the factors that might have influenced their responses and hence the results of the study.

Conclusion

As shown in the results, the use of Experiential learning was the highest in Business School 1 (M=10.33), then in Business School 2 (M=8.50), Business School 3 (M=5.73), Business School 4 (M=4.31), and Business School 5 (M=3.83), respectively. The findings indicate that experiential learning, though comparatively a new concept in business education as compared to Medicine, Engineering and Science in Pakistan, has recently found its way to the discipline (Ranganath, 2012). However, the extent to which it is implemented as compared to the traditional teacher centered approach is yet to be ascertained.

The five universities in the research are rated as top five business schools in Karachi by the Higher Education Commission (HEC). HEC’s evaluation criteria include research, professional development programs, resources, qualification and accomplishments of teachers, and certain other factors (Higher Education Commission, 2014). It is important to note that HEC does not include the teaching methodology as a factor in the evaluation criteria of universities. Therefore, the findings might be attributed to the fact that the said factors perhaps have a relationship on the teaching methodology of a business school.

An important implication of the findings is that there are attempts by the teachers to cater to the growing needs of the employers and experiential learning is being implemented in all five universities of Karachi included in the study. However, as the
findings indicate, some of the universities are using it more than the others but the factors supporting the said implementation need to be ascertained.

The findings further indicate that the teachers have the required resources to implement experiential learning similar to the findings of a recent research conducted in Pakistan which demonstrates that not only the college teachers are motivated to improve the existing practices of teaching, but the required resources for such change are available within the academic set up (Sultana & Zaki, 2015).

As discussed, experiential learning is commonly used in the top-notch business schools in the developed countries of the world. Since the local context of teaching in Pakistan is teacher centered and the students are also attuned to the traditional approach of teaching since their early years of education, the study has contextualized the value of experiential learning and has asserted that it is as valuable as in any developed part of the world since Pakistani students are as responsive to an experiential intervention in business education as a student of any other developed part of the world could be.
References


